

# Le trasformazioni del sistema produttivo italiano: le cooperative

Commenti di  
Patrizia Battilani

# La produttività

Zevi, Alberto. 1982. "The Performance of Italian Producer Cooperatives." In Derek Jones and Jan Svejnar, eds., *Participatory and Self-Managed Firms*. Lexington, Mass.: Lexington Books

- Confronto fra cooperative e imprese private
- Anni 1972-1975
- Nessuna differenza significativa in termini di VA/ore lavorate.

Will Bartlett, John Cable, Saul Estrin, Derek C. Jones, Stephen C. Smith, Labor-Managed Cooperatives and Private Firms in North Central Italy: An Empirical Comparison, *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, 46, 1, 1992.

*Table 3. Average Wages, Salaries, and Labor Costs.*

<i>Description</i>	<i>Co-ops</i>	<i>Private Firms</i>	<i>T-stat.</i>
<i>Average Wages:<sup>a</sup></i>			
Unskilled	1124.28	1148.61	0.34
Skilled	1177.05	1233.13	0.67
Supervisors	1473.38	1416.80	0.45
White-Collar	1260.34	1440.73	1.80*
Managers	1983.75	3183.95	3.96***
Supplementary Pay (pa.)	1224.40	1193.78	0.15
Managerial/Unskilled Wage Ratio	1.67	2.86	4.09***
Labor Cost/Hr. <sup>b</sup>	9.10	8.90	0.6

- Settore manifatturiero

*Table 9. Productivity: Firms in Emilia-Romagna, 1981–85.*

<i>Description</i>	<i>Co-ops</i>	<i>Private Firms</i>	<i>T-stat.</i>
Value Added/Employees <sup>a</sup>	22.38	16.39	2.23**
Value Added/Hour <sup>b</sup>	13.80	10.20	2.26**
Value Added/fixed assets	2.19	1.38	2.2**

*Table 8. Balance Sheet Data: Firms in Emilia-Romagna, 1981–85.*

<i>Description</i>	<i>Co-ops</i>	<i>Private Firms</i>	<i>T-stat.</i>
Fixed Assets per Head	14.53	23.36	2.52**
Depreciation Rate <sup>b</sup>	0.14	0.11	2.23**
Debt per Head <sup>c</sup>	43.18	34.64	1.96*
Excluding Member Loans	39.82	34.64	1.20

# Ben Craig and John Pencavel, The Behavior of Worker Cooperatives: The Plywood Companies of the Pacific Northwest

## The American Economic Review, 82, 5, 1992

TABLE 3—SAMPLE MEANS (AND STANDARD DEVIATIONS) OF VARIABLES BY TYPE OF FIRM AND BY YEAR

Variable	Type of firm			All firms
	Classical	Union	Co-op	
1972:				
Nominal hourly wage	5.31 (1.10)	5.63 (1.42)	4.72 (0.52)	5.36 (1.24)
Employment	102 (82)	278 (152)	262 (119)	255 (143)
Annual hours per worker	1,960 (57)	1,916 (121)	2,253 (299)	2009 (227)
Index of output price	164.5 (14.6)	159.3 (9.4)	154.1 (0)	158.5 (8.7)
Index of price of logs	120.5 (4.2)	115.8 (8.6)	117.7 (3.5)	116.8 (7.2)
Inventories of logs	804 (429)	6,021 (6,334)	7,302 (2,997)	5,809 (5,474)
Output	3.70 (2.85)	7.52 (3.63)	6.79 (2.04)	6.93 (3.29)
Labor productivity	18.9 (0.4)	16.4 (10.6)	12.2 (2.9)	15.6 (8.6)
1980:				
Nominal hourly wage	11.49 (2.75)	11.58 (2.23)	8.79 (1.06)	10.79 (2.40)
Employment	73 (31)	236 (135)	259 (59)	203 (123)
Annual hours per worker	1,425 (403)	1,759 (326)	1,935 (388)	1,727 (397)
Index of output price	339.1 (26.4)	325.0 (23.2)	294.1 (47.5)	319.9 (35.5)
Index of price of logs	284.1 (25.1)	291.6 (33.0)	295.6 (20.5)	290.9 (27.6)
Inventories of logs	1,293 (2,760)	4,047 (5,581)	5,901 (6,672)	3,894 (5,484)
Output	1.18 (0.76)	5.07 (3.10)	5.69 (2.36)	4.30 (3.05)
Labor productivity	12.3 (8.2)	13.5 (8.2)	11.5 (3.5)	12.7 (7.0)
1984:				
Nominal hourly wage	10.20 (6.29)	12.65 (2.51)	10.31 (1.64)	11.26 (3.65)
Employment	67 (65)	233 (88)	240 (73)	194 (106)
Annual hours per worker	1,487 (905)	1,876 (324)	1,962 (280)	1,807 (529)
Index of output price	279.3 (48.7)	302.7 (3.8)	289.0 (43.9)	292.3 (34.7)
Index of price of logs	241.0 (17.5)	230.7 (12.1)	233.0 (14.8)	234.0 (14.5)
Inventories of logs	75 (183)	3,086 (5,214)	5,698 (7,866)	3,204 (5,848)
Output	1.87 (2.66)	5.09 (3.10)	5.18 (1.83)	4.31 (2.90)
Labor productivity	12.2 (6.2)	12.0 (6.5)	11.4 (3.2)	11.8 (5.3)

Participation and Productivity: A Comparison of Worker Cooperatives and Conventional Firms in the Plywood Industry, Ben Craig, John Pencavel, Henry Farber, Alan Krueger, Brookings Papers on Economic Activity. Microeconomics, Vol. 1995 (1995),

**Table 3. Mean Values of Variables by Firm Type and by Production**

Variable	Plywood only				Veneer only			Both plywood and veneer				All mills			
	Co-op	Union	Classical	All	Union	Classical	All	Co-op	Union	Classical	All	Co-op	Union	Classical	All
Output ( <i>X</i> )	135.8	138.4	68.6	131.4	49.2	19.5	34.7	113.5	126.2	51.6	117.7	132.1	114.0	33.8	102.3
Worker-hours ( <i>L</i> )	60.1	58.4	22.4	55.9	33.2	7.7	20.7	49.1	59.2	12.2	53.5	58.3	52.9	11.3	46.0
Log inputs ( <i>G</i> )	243.0	280.9	158.9	256.3	197.8	89.9	145.1	148.2	254.9	110.0	227.2	227.2	253.2	106.9	219.3
Lathe size ( <i>K</i> )	77.4	72.6	61.7	73.5	68.5	49.2	59.1	79.3	77.2	37.0	73.8	77.8	73.2	50.4	69.8
<i>X/L</i>	236.0	257.0	290.1	252.1	163.7	268.1	214.8	235.2	259.1	399.2	268.6	235.9	236.5	288.7	246.5
<i>X/G</i>	6.47	6.89	4.03	6.49	2.43	2.43	2.43	12.24	8.36	4.67	8.55	7.43	6.37	3.04	5.95
<i>X/K</i>	1.82	2.57	1.09	2.17	0.75	0.42	0.59	1.46	1.99	1.59	1.88	1.76	1.96	0.70	1.67
<i>L/G</i>	28.8	34.3	19.3	31.0	24.3	15.2	19.8	50.9	44.8	12.3	42.6	32.5	35.6	15.7	31.0

Source: Authors' data.

**Table 5. Instrumental Variable Estimates of Equation 2**

<i>Variable</i>	<i>Worker-hours</i>	<i>Logs</i>	<i>Lathe</i>
Intercept	1.315 (0.588)	0.896 (0.238)	3.110 (0.993)
$C_i$	-0.108 (0.206)	0.583 (0.123)	1.100 (0.212)
$U_i$	-0.154 (0.180)	0.457 (0.100)	1.007 (0.166)
$(PONLY)_{it}$	-0.035 (0.116)	-0.138 (0.086)	0.056 (0.143)
$(VONLY)_{it}$	-0.665 (0.152)	-1.106 (0.101)	-1.266 (0.165)
$\ln(p_j/p_0)_{it}$	-0.109 (0.148)	-0.183 (0.214)	-0.530 (0.214)
$\ln Z_{jit}$	-0.183 (0.090)	-0.341 (0.043)	-1.186 (0.182)
$T_t$	-0.001 (0.009)	-0.002 (0.007)	0.006 (0.015)

**Table 8. Predictions of the Logarithm of Output for Production Function Parameters of Different Firm Types**

<i>Estimates</i>	<i>Co-ops'</i> <i>parameters</i>	<i>Union mills'</i> <i>parameters</i>	<i>Classical</i> <i>mills'</i> <i>parameters</i>
<i>Ordinary least-squares estimates</i>			
Co-op mills' inputs	4.928	4.815	4.820
Union mills' inputs	4.857	4.718	4.715
Classical mills' inputs	4.007	3.583	3.482
<i>Instrumental variable estimates</i>			
Co-op mills' inputs	4.925	4.813	4.864
Union mills' inputs	4.850	4.710	4.740
Classical mills' inputs	3.906	3.492	3.453

Source: Authors' data.

Note: Each entry is the average value of the predictions over all mills within each firm type.



# Qual è il problema?

- La letteratura ci dice che cooperative e imprese convenzionali utilizzano funzioni di produzione diverse.
- Per rafforzare le conclusioni sulla produttività occorre andare ad una stima della funzione di produzione.
- L'indicatore VA/addetti oppure VA/ore lavorate non è sufficiente per misurare l'efficienza

# I salari

- Questo è un tema che merita un approfondimento.
- Pencaval 2006 controlla per scolarizzazione e genere
- Bartlett, Cable, Estrin 1992 per funzione svolta all'interno dell'impresa
  - (gli unskilled guadagnano uguale; i manager cooperativi molto meno)
  - Tema dell'uguaglianza all'interno della cooperativa
- Oggi occorrerebbe controllare rispetto ai contratti a termine

# Le esportazioni

- Problema storico
- Limiti istituzionali:
  - Società cooperativa europea dal 2003
  - Problemi di organizzazione delle relazioni sociali
  - Abitualmente le coop vanno all'estero con società per azioni

# Chi sono i soci?

- Lavoratori e utenti sono molto diversi
- Manca una base teorica per le cooperative di utenti che però sono le più diffuse

**Buon lavoro!**