Fiscal Sustainability: Analytical Developments and Emerging Policy Issues

Papers presented at the Banca d’Italia workshop held in Perugia, 3-5 April, 2008
Earlier versions of the papers in this volume were presented at the Banca d’Italia workshop on Fiscal Sustainability: Analytical Developments and Emerging Policy Issues held in Perugia, S.A.Di.Ba., on 3-5 April, 2008. We wish to thank the staff of S.A.Di.Ba. for their assistance in all aspects of the organization of the workshop.

Previous Public Finance workshops have addressed the following topics:

“Indicators of Structural Budget Balances” (1998)
“Fiscal Sustainability” (2000)
“Fiscal Rules” (2001)
“Public Expenditure” (2005)
“Fiscal Indicators” (2006)

The proceedings may be requested from:

Banca d’Italia
Biblioteca
Via Nazionale, 91
00184 Roma
Italy

The contents of this book do not commit Banca d’Italia. Responsibility for the ideas and opinions expressed rests with the authors of the individual papers.

© 2008 Banca d’Italia
CONTENTS

Foreword
Daniele Franco
(Banca d’Italia) ...................................................................................................................................................... p. 11

Introduction
Daniele Franco, Maria Rosaria Marino and Pietro Rizza
(Banca d’Italia) ...................................................................................................................................................... p. 13

Session 1
NEW METHODOLOGIES FOR ASSESSING FISCAL SUSTAINABILITY

1. “How to” of Fiscal Sustainability in Oil-rich Countries: The Case of Azerbaijan
Luca Bandiera, * Nina Budina* and Sweder van Wijnbergen**
( * World Bank)
( ** University of Amsterdam) ........................................................................................................................ p. 29

2. Fiscal Sustainability in the EU: A Panel Data Diagnostic
António Afonso* and Christophe Rault**
( * European Central Bank and ISEG/TU Lisbon – Technical University of Lisbon)
( ** University of Orleans, University of Michigan, LEO, IZA and WDI) .................. p. 49

3. Refinements to the Probabilistic Approach to Fiscal Sustainability Analysis
Nathaniel Frank* and Eduardo Ley**
( * University of Oxford)
( ** World Bank) ........................................................................................................................................ p. 69

4. Reporting on Federal Fiscal Sustainability in the United States
Jagadeesh Gokhale
(CATO Institute, Washington D.C.) ..................................................................................................................... p. 83

Joan Gil,* Miguel Ángel López-Garcia, ** Jorge Onrubia, *** Ció Paxtot* and Guadalupe Souto**
( * Universitat de Barcelona)
( ** Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona)
( *** Universidad Complutense de Madrid) ......................................................................................................... p. 97
6. **Tangos, Sambas or Belly Dancing? Or, Do Spreads Dance to the Same Rhythm? Signaling Regime Sustainability in Argentina, Brazil and Turkey**  
   Santiago Herrera* and Ferhan Salman**  
   (* World Bank)  
   (**) Central Bank of Turkey)  
   Comments  
   Carine Bouthevillain  
   (Banque de France)  
   Comments  
   Adi Brender  
   (Bank of Israel)  
   Comments  
   Ernesto Rezk  
   (Universidad Nacional de Córdoba, Argentina)  

**Session 2**  
**SUSTAINABILITY ASSESSMENT AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

7. **Economic Growth and Fiscal Sustainability in the EU: The Impact of an Ageing Population**  
   Giuseppe Carone, Declan Costello, Nuria Diez Guardia, Per Eckefeldt and Gilles Mourre  
   (European Commission)  

8. **Fiscal Sustainability and Policy Implications for the Euro Area**  
   Fabrizio Balassone,* Jorge Cunha,** Geert Langenus,*** Bernhard Manzke,° Jeanne Pavot, oo Doris Prammer ooo and Pietro Tommasino*  
   (* Banca d’Italia)  
   (**) Banco de Portugal)  
   (*** National Bank of Belgium)  
   (° Deutsche Bundesbank)  
   (oo Banque de France)  
   (ooo Österreichische Nationalbank)  

9. **Restoring Fiscal Sustainability in the Euro Area: Raise Taxes or Curb Spending?**  
   Boris Courmède* and Frédéric Gonand**  
   (* OECD)  
   (**) Ministry of the Economy, Finances and Employment, France)
10. **Pensions Under Ageing Populations and the EU Stability and Growth Pact**
Roel Beetsma* and Heikki Oksanen**
(* University of Amsterdam)
(** European Commission) ................................................................. p. 289

11. **Wealth Effects and Public Debt in an Endogenous Growth Model**
Jérôme Creel* and Francesco Saraceno**
(* ESCP-EAP and OFCE, France)
(** OFCE, France) ................................................................................... p. 315

12. **Fiscal Sustainability and Structural Reforms – Incorporating Labour Supply**
Responses in Long-term Modelling
Anna Kleen and Thomas Pettersson
(Ministry of Finance, Sweden) ...................................................................... p. 333

13. **Will We Treat Future Generations Fairly? Italian Fiscal Policy through the**
Prism of Generational Accounting
Pietro Rizza and Pietro Tommasino
(Banca d’Italia) ............................................................................................ p. 353

14. **The Long-term Sustainability of Public Finance in Japan**
Yukihiro Oshika*
(* Ministry of Finance, Japan) ........................................................................ p. 379

**Comments**
Maximilian Baylor
(Department of Finance, Canada) ................................................................. p. 399

**Comments**
Ranjana Madhusudhan
(New Jersey Treasury) ................................................................................ p. 405

**Comments**
Peter Part
(Federal Ministry of Finance, Austria) ........................................................ p. 411

**Session 3**

**HEALTH CARE AND LONG-TERM CARE**

15. **Health-care Expenditure Projections: Results, Policy Conclusions and**
Recommendations for Future Work
Bartosz Przywara and Declan Costello
(European Commission) ................................................................................ p. 415

16. **An Examination of Health-spending Growth in the United States: Past Trends**
and Future Prospects
Glenn Follette and Louise Sheiner
(Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System) .................................. p. 443
17. **Health-care Financing Reforms in Central and Eastern Europe: Common Problems and Possible Approaches**
   Dubravko Mihaljek  
   *(Bank for International Settlements)* ................................................................. p. 465

18. **The Impact of Ageing on Health and Long-term Care: The Case of Italy**
   Rocco Aprile  
   *(Ministry of the Economy and Finance, Italy)* ...................................................... p. 491

19. **Projections of Elderly Health Development and Costs for Long-term Care in Sweden**
   Mårten Lagergren  
   *(Stockholm Gerontology Research Centre, Sweden)* ........................................ p. 523

20. **The Health-care System and its Fiscal Impact in Colombia**
   Sergio Clavijo and Camila Torrente  
   *(ANIF, Colombia)* .................................................................................................... p. 533

   Dennis Botman and Manmohan Kumar  
   *(International Monetary Fund)* ............................................................................. p. 553

**Comments**
   Cláudia Braz  
   *(Banco de Portugal)* ................................................................................................ p. 599

**Comments**
   Maura Francese  
   *(Banca d’Italia)* ...................................................................................................... p. 603

**Comments**
   Margit Schratzenstaller  
   *(WIFO, Austria)* ................................................................................................... p. 607

---

**Session 4**

**ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES AND SUSTAINABILITY REPORTING IN THE POLICY DEBATE**

22. **Climate Change Brings Stormy Days: Case Studies on the Impact of Extreme Weather Events on Public Finances**
   Martin Heipertz and Christiane Nickel  
   *(European Central Bank)* ..................................................................................... p. 613
23. The Effects of Long-run Emission Targets on the Finnish Economy
Markku Stenborg* and Juha Honkatukia
(* Ministry of Finance, Finland)
(** Government Institute for Economic Research, Finland) ........................................ p. 631

24. The German Experience with Sustainability Reporting
Christian Kastrop and Britta Velleuer
(Federal Ministry of Finance, Germany) ........................................................................ p. 643

25. Are Italy’s Public Finances Sustainable? The Role of Demography, Productivity
and Labour Markets
Paolo Biraschi, Lorenzo Codogno, Federico Giammusso, Manuela Nenna and Juan
Pradelli
(Ministry of the Economy and finance, Italy) ........................................................... p. 661

26. Five Years of the UK’s Long-term Public Finance Report: Has it Made any
Difference?
Frank Eich
(UK Treasury) ........................................................................................................... p. 687

27. Projecting Pension Expenditure in Spain: On Uncertainty, Communication and
Transparency
Rafael Doménech* and Ángel Melguizo**
(† Economic Bureau of the Prime Minister, Spain)
(‡ University of Valencia, Spain) ................................................................................. p. 707

28. Assessing Fiscal Sustainability in the G-7 Countries
David Hauner, Daniel Leigh and Michael Skaarup
(International Monetary Fund) .................................................................................... p. 731

Comments
Yngve Lindh
(Ministry of Finance, Sweden) .................................................................................. p. 757

Comments
Lucio R. Pench
(European Commission) ........................................................................................... p. 761

Comments
Robert Tannenwald
(Federal Reserve Bank of Boston) ................................................................................ p. 767
List of contributors

António Afonso (European Central Bank and ISEG/TULisbon – Technical University of Lisbon)
Rocco Aprile (Ministry of the Economy and finance, Italy)
Fabrizio Balassone (Banca d’Italia)
Luca Bandiera (World Bank)
Maximilian Baylor (Department of Finance, Canada)
Roel Beetsma (University of Amsterdam)
Paolo Biraschi (Ministry of the Economy and finance, Italy)
Dennis Botman (International Monetary Fund)
Cláudia Braz (Banco de Portugal)
Adi Brender (Bank of Israel)
Carine Bouthevillain (Banque de France)
Nina Budina (World Bank)
Giuseppe Carone (European Commission)
Sergio Clavijo (ANIF, Colombia)
Lorenzo Codogno (Ministry of the Economy and finance, Italy)
Declan Costello (European Commission)
Boris Cournède (OECD)
Jérôme Creel (ESCP-EAP and OFCE, France)
Jorge Cunha (Banco de Portugal)
Nuria Diez Guardia (European Commission)
Rafael Doménech (Economic Bureau of the Prime Minister, Spain)
Per Eckefeldt (European Commission)
Frank Eich (UK Treasury)
Glenn Follette (Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System)
Maura Francesc (Banca d’Italia)
Daniele Franco (Banca d’Italia)
Nathaniel Frank (University of Oxford)
Federico Giammusso (Ministry of the Economy and finance, Italy)
Joan Gil (Universitat de Barcelona)
Jagadeesh Gokhale (CATO Institute, Washington, D.C.)
Frédéric Gonand (Ministry of the Economy, Finances and Employment, France)
David Hauner (International Monetary Fund)
Martin Heipertz (European Central Bank)
Santiago Herrera (World Bank)
Juha Honkatukia (Government Institute for Economic Research, Finland)
Christian Kastrop (Federal Ministry of Finance, Germany)
Anna Kleen (Ministry of Finance, Sweden)
Mannmohan Kumar (International Monetary Fund)
Mårten Lagergren (Stockholm Gerontology Research Centre, Sweden)
Geert Langenus (National Bank of Belgium)
Daniel Leigh (International Monetary Fund)
Eduardo Ley (World Bank)
Yngve Lindh (Ministry of Finance, Sweden)
Miguel Ángel López-García (Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona)
Ranjana Madhusudhan (New Jersey Treasury)
Bernhard Manzke (Deutsche Bundesbank)
Ángel Melguizo (University of Valencia, Spain)
Dubravko Mihaljek (Bank for International Settlements)
Gilles Mourre (European Commission)
Manuela Nenna (Ministry of the Economy and finance, Italy)
Christiane Nickel (European Central Bank)
Heikki Oksanen (European Commission)
Jorge Onrubia (Universidad Complutense de Madrid)
Yukihiro Oshika (Ministry of Finance, Japan)
Peter Part (Federal Ministry of Finance, Austria)
Jeanne Pavot (Banque de France)
Ció Paxtot (Universitat de Barcelona)
Lucio R. Pench (European Commission)
Thomas Pettersson (Ministry of Finance, Sweden)
Juan Pradelli (Ministry of the Economy and finance, Italy)
Doris Prammer (Österreichische Nationalbank)
Bartosz Przywara (European Commission)
Christophe Rault (University of Orleans, University of Michigan, LEO, IZA and WDI)
Ernesto Rezk (Universidad Nacional de Córdoba, Argentina)
Pietro Rizza (Banca d’Italia)
Ferhan Salman (Central Bank of Turkey)
Francesco Saraceno (OFCE, France)
Margit Schratzenstaller (WIFO, Austria)
Louise Sheiner (Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System)
Michael Skaarup (International Monetary Fund)
Guadalupe Souto (Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona)
Markku Stenborg (Ministry of Finance, Finland)
Robert Tannenwald (Federal Reserve Bank of Boston)
Pietro Tommasino (Banca d’Italia)
Camila Torrente (ANIF, Colombia)
Sweder van Wijnbergen (University of Amsterdam)
Britta Velleuer (Federal Ministry of Finance, Germany)