



BANCA D'ITALIA
EUROSISTEMA

Fiscal Policy: Lessons from the Crisis

Seminari e convegni
Workshops and Conferences

PUBLIC FINANCE WORKSHOP
Papers presented at the Banca d'Italia workshop
held in Perugia, 25-27 March, 2010

Earlier versions of the papers in this volume were presented at the Banca d'Italia workshop on "Fiscal Policy: Lessons from the Crisis" held in Perugia, S.A.Di.Ba., on 25-27 March, 2010. We wish to thank the staff of S.A.Di.Ba. for their assistance in all aspects of the organization of the workshop.

Previous Public Finance workshops have addressed the following topics:

- "Indicators of Structural Budget Balances" (1998)
- "Fiscal Sustainability" (2000)
- "Fiscal Rules" (2001)
- "The Impact of Fiscal Policy" (2002)
- "Tax Policy" (2003)
- "Public Debt" (2004)
- "Public Expenditure" (2005)
- "Fiscal Indicators" (2006)
- "Fiscal Policy: Current Issues and Challenges" (2007)
- "Fiscal Sustainability: Analytical Developments and Emerging Policy Issues" (2008)
- "Pension Reform, Fiscal Policy and Economic Performance" (2009)

The proceedings may be requested from:

Banca d'Italia
Biblioteca
Via Nazionale, 91
00184 Roma
Italy

They are also available at the Banca d'Italia website:

http://www.bancaditalia.it/studiricerche/convegni/atti;internal&action=_setlanguage.action?LANGUAGE=en
and:
http://www.bancaditalia.it/pubblicazioni/seminari_convegni;internal&action=_setlanguage.action?LANGUAGE=en

The contents of this book do not commit Banca d'Italia.
Responsibility for the ideas and opinions expressed rests with the authors of the papers.
Printed by the Printing Office of Banca d'Italia, Rome, March 2011

CONTENTS

Foreword

Daniele Franco (<i>Banca d'Italia</i>).....	p. 11
--	-------

Introduction

Marika Cioffi, Daniele Franco and Maria Rosaria Marino (<i>Banca d'Italia</i>).....	p. 13
--	-------

Session 1

AUTOMATIC STABILISERS AND DISCRETIONARY FISCAL POLICY

- 1. Government Fiscal and Real Economy Responses to the Crises: Automatic Stabilisers Versus Automatic Stabilisation**
Jonas Fischer and Isabelle Justo
(*European Commission*) p. 29
- 2. Are the Effects of Fiscal Changes Different in Times of Crisis and Non-crisis? The French Case**
Carine Bouthevillain* and Gilles Dufrénot**
(* *Banque de France*)
(** *Université d'Aix-Marseille and Banque de France*) p. 49
- 3. Fiscal Activism in Booms, Busts and Beyond**
Ludger Schuknecht
(*European Central Bank*)..... p. 75
- 4. The Reaction of Fiscal Policy to the Crisis in Italy and Germany: Are They Really Polar Cases in the European Context?**
Britta Hamburg,* Sandro Momigliano,** Bernhard Manzke* and Stefano Siviero**
(* *Bundesbank*)
(** *Banca d'Italia*) p. 99
- 5. Fiscal Policy in the United States: Automatic Stabilizers, Discretionary Fiscal Policy Actions, and the Economy**
Glenn Follette and Byron Lutz
(*Federal Reserve Board*)..... p. 125

6. Fiscal Policy in Latin America: Countercyclical and Sustainable at Last? Christian Daude, Ángel Melguizo and Alejandro Neut (<i>OECD</i>).....	p. 149
7. The Impact of the International Financial Crisis Upon Emerging Economies and the Performance of Discretionary Fiscal Policies: The Case of Argentina Ernesto Rezk, Ginette Lafit and Vanina Ricca (<i>National University of Córdoba, Argentina</i>).....	p. 185
Comments	
Adi Brender (<i>Bank of Israel</i>).....	p. 215
Comments	
Geert Langenus (<i>National Bank of Belgium</i>).....	p. 221
Comments	
Martin Larch (<i>European Commission</i>).....	p. 227

Session 2 FISCAL IMPULSE

8. Fiscal Policy and Macroeconomic Stability: New Evidence and Policy Implications Xavier Debrun* and Radhicka Kapoor** (* <i>IMF</i>) (** <i>London School of Economics</i>).....	p. 233
9. Fiscal Stabilisation Plans and the Outlook for the World Economy Patrick Van Brusselen (<i>Federal Planning Bureau, Belgium</i>).....	p. 257
10. Fiscal Policy Multipliers in the EU During the Credit Crisis: A DSGE Analysis Werner Röger and Jan in 't Veld (<i>European Commission</i>).....	p. 277
11. Fiscal and Monetary Policy Interaction: A Simulation-based Analysis of a Two-country New Keynesian DSGE Model with Heterogeneous Households Marcos Valli Jorge and Fabia A. De Carvalho (<i>Banco Central do Brasil</i>).....	p. 305

12. Short-term Macroeconomic Effects of the Fiscal Stimulus Measures in Austria	
Serguei Kaniovski and Margit Schratzenstaller (<i>Austrian Institute of Economic Research, WIFO</i>)	p. 347
13. Getting It Right: How Fiscal Response Can Shorten Crisis Length and Raise Growth	
Emanuele Baldacci, [*] Sanjeev Gupta [*] and Carlos Mulas-Granados ^{**} ([*] <i>IMF</i>) (^{**} <i>Universidad Complutense de Madrid</i>)	p. 365
14. Fiscal Policy and Growth: Do Financial Crises Make a Difference?	
António Afonso, [*] Hans Peter Grüner ^{**} ^{***} and Christina Kolerus ^{**} ([*] <i>ECB and ISEG/TUL – Technical University of Lisbon</i>) (^{**} <i>University of Mannheim</i>) (^{***} <i>Centre for Economic Policy Research</i>)	p. 383
15. Tax Policies to Improve the Stability of Financial Markets	
Jason McDonald and Shane Johnson (<i>Australian Treasury</i>)	p. 405
Comments	
Yngve Lindh (<i>Ministry of Finance, Sweden</i>)	p. 427
Comments	
Daniela Monacelli (<i>Banca d'Italia</i>)	p. 433
Comments	
Galen Countryman (<i>Department of Finance, Canada</i>)	p. 443

Session 3

FISCAL POLICY AND FISCAL RULES

16. The Great Crisis and Fiscal Institutions in Eastern and Central Europe and Central Asia	
Luca Barbone, Roumeen Islam and Luis Álvaro Sanchez (<i>World Bank</i>)	p. 447
17. Fiscal Policy in Colombia and a Prospective Analysis After the 2008 Financial Crisis	
Ignacio Lozano (<i>Banco de la República de Colombia</i>)	p. 473

18. Fiscal Institutions in New Zealand and the Question of a Spending Cap Tracy Mears, Gary Blick, Tim Hampton and John Janssen (<i>New Zealand Treasury</i>)	<i>p.</i> 495
19. Fiscal Multipliers in the Euro Area Pablo Burriel*, Francisco De Castro*, Daniel Garrote*, Esther Gordo*, Joan Paredes** and Javier J. Pérez* (* <i>Banco de España</i>) (** <i>European Central Bank</i>)	<i>p.</i> 519
20. The Crisis, Automatic Stabilisation, and the Stability Pact Jérôme Creel* and Francesco Saraceno** (* <i>ESCP Europe and OFCE/Sciences Po</i>) (** <i>OFCE/Sciences Po</i>)	<i>p.</i> 535
21. EU Fiscal Consolidation After the Financial Crisis – Lessons from Past Experiences Salvador Barrios, Sven Langedijk and Lucio Pench (<i>European Commission</i>)	<i>p.</i> 561
22. Impact of the Global Crisis on Sub-national Governments' Finances Teresa Ter-Minassian* and Annalisa Fedelino** (* <i>formerly IMF</i>) (** <i>IMF</i>)	<i>p.</i> 595
Comments David Heald (<i>University of Aberdeen Business School</i>)	<i>p.</i> 613
Comments Christian Kastrop (<i>Ministry of Finance, Germany</i>)	<i>p.</i> 619
Comments Jana Kremer (<i>Bundesbank</i>)	<i>p.</i> 621

Session 4

THE LEGACY OF THE CRISIS AND THE EXIT STRATEGY

23. The Consequences of Banking Crises for Public Debt Davide Furceri* and Aleksandra Zdzienicka** (* <i>OECD</i>) (** <i>GATE-CNRS, University of Lyon</i>)	<i>p.</i> 627
--	---------------

- 24. Implications of the Crisis for Public Finances: The Case of Austria**
Lukas Reiss and Walpurga Köhler-Töglhofer
(*Österreichische Nationalbank*)..... p. 649
- 25. The First Time You Never Forget: The Success of Brazil in the 2009 Crisis and the Need for Third-generation Reforms**
Joaquim Vieira Levy
(*formerly State of Rio de Janeiro*)..... p. 671
- 26. Structural Aspects of the Japanese Budget**
Michio Saito
(*Ministry of Finance, Japan*) p. 693
- 27. Cyclical and Structural Components of Corporate Tax Revenues in Japan**
Junji Ueda*, Daisuke Ishikawa** and Tadashi Tsutsui**
(* *University of Kyoto*)
(** *Ministry of Finance, Japan*)..... p. 705
- 28. Optimal Fiscal Policy in the Post-crisis World**
Francesco Caprioli, Pietro Rizza and Pietro Tommasino
(*Banca d'Italia*)..... p. 727
- 29. A Note on Optimal Fiscal Rule for Turkey**
Mehmet Yörükoğlu
(*Central Bank of the Republic of Turkey*) p. 747
- 30. The New Medium-term Budgetary Objectives and the Problem of Fiscal Sustainability After the Crisis**
Paolo Biraschi*, Marco Cacciotti*, Davide Iacovoni* and Juan Pradelli**
(* *Ministero dell'Economia e delle Finanze*)
(** *The World Bank and Università degli Studi di Roma Tor Vergata*) p. 761
- Comments**
Carlo Cottarelli
(*IMF*)..... p. 783
- Comments**
Richard Hemming
(*Duke University*)..... p. 787
- Comments**
Thomasz Jędrzejowicz
(*Narodowy Bank Polski*) p. 789

Contributors

António Afonso (*ECB and ISEG/TUL – Technical University of Lisbon*)
Emanuele Baldacci (*IMF*)
Luca Barbone (*World Bank*)
Salvador Barrios (*European Commission*)
Paolo Biraschi (*Ministero dell’Economia e delle Finanze*)
Gary Blick (*New Zealand Treasury*)
Carine Bouthevillain (*Banque de France*)
Adi Brender (*Bank of Israel*)
Pablo Burriel (*Banco de España*)
Marco Cacciotti (*Ministero dell’Economia e delle Finanze*)
Francesco Caprioli (*Banca d’Italia*)
Marika Cioffi (*Banca d’Italia*)
Carlo Cottarelli (*IMF*)
Galen Countryman (*Department of Finance, Canada*)
Jérôme Creel (*ESCP Europe and OFCE/Sciences Po*)
Christian Daude (*OECD*)
Xavier Debrun (*IMF*)
Fabia A. De Carvalho (*Banco Central do Brasil*)
Francisco De Castro (*Banco de España*)
Gilles Dufrénot (*Université d’Aix-Marseille and Banque de France*)
Annalisa Fedelino (*IMF*)
Jonas Fischer (*European Commission*)
Glenn Follette (*Federal Reserve Board*)
Daniele Franco (*Banca d’Italia*)
Davide Furceri (*OECD*)
Daniel Garrote (*Banco de España*)
Esther Gordo (*Banco de España*)
Hans Peter Grüner (*University of Mannheim and Centre for Economic Policy Research*)
Sanjeev Gupta (*IMF*)
Britta Hamburg (*Bundesbank*)
Tim Hampton (*New Zealand Treasury*)
David Heald (*University of Aberdeen Business School*)
Richard Hemming (*Duke University*)
Davide Iacovoni (*Ministero dell’Economia e delle Finanze*)
Jan in ’t Veld (*European Commission*)
Daisuke Ishikawa (*Ministry of Finance, Japan*)
Roumeen Islam (*World Bank*)
John Janssen (*New Zealand Treasury*)
Thomasz Jędrzejowicz (*Narodowy Bank Polski*)
Shane Johnson (*Australian Treasury*)
Isabelle Justo (*European Commission*)
Serguei Kaniovski (*Austrian Institute of Economic Research, WIFO*)
Radhicka Kapoor (*London School of Economics*)

Christian Kastrop (*Ministry of Finance, Germany*)
Walpurga Köhler-Töglhofer (*Österreichische Nationalbank*)
Christina Kolerus (*University of Mannheim*)
Jana Kremer (*Bundesbank*)
Ginette Lafit (*National University of Córdoba, Argentina*)
Sven Langedijk (*European Commission*)
Geert Langenus (*National Bank of Belgium*)
Martin Larch (*European Commission*)
Yngve Lindh (*Ministry of Finance, Sweden*)
Ignacio Lozano (*Banco de la República de Colombia*)
Byron Lutz (*Federal Reserve Board*)
Bernhard Manzke (*Bundesbank*)
Maria Rosaria Marino (*Banca d'Italia*)
Jason McDonald (*Australian Treasury*)
Tracy Mears (*New Zealand Treasury*)
Ángel Melguizo (*OECD*)
Sandro Momigliano (*Banca d'Italia*)
Daniela Monacelli (*Banca d'Italia*)
Carlos Mulas-Granados (*Universidad Complutense de Madrid*)
Alejandro Neut (*OECD*)
Joan Paredes (*European Central Bank*)
Lucio Pench (*European Commission*)
Javier J. Pérez (*Banco de España*)
Juan Pradelli (*The World Bank and Università degli Studi di Roma Tor Vergata*)
Lukas Reiss (*Österreichische Nationalbank*)
Ernesto Rezk (*National University of Córdoba, Argentina*)
Vanina Ricca (*National University of Córdoba, Argentina*)
Pietro Rizza (*Banca d'Italia*)
Werner Röger (*European Commission*)
Michio Saito (*Ministry of Finance, Japan*)
Luis Álvaro Sanchez (*World Bank*)
Francesco Saraceno (*OFCE/Sciences Po*)
Margit Schratzenstaller (*Austrian Institute of Economic Research, WIFO*)
Ludger Schuknecht (*European Central Bank*)
Stefano Siviero (*Banca d'Italia*)
Teresa Ter-Minassian (*formerly IMF*)
Pietro Tommasino (*Banca d'Italia*)
Tadashi Tsutsui (*Ministry of Finance, Japan*)
Junji Ueda (*University of Kyoto*)
Marcos Valli Jorge (*Banco Central do Brasil*)
Patrick Van Brusselen (*Federal Planning Bureau, Belgium*)
Joaquim Vieira Levy (*formerly State of Rio de Janeiro*)
Mehmet Yörükoğlu (*Central Bank of the Republic of Turkey*)
Aleksandra Zdzienicka (*GATE-CNRS, University of Lyon*)