



BANCA D'ITALIA
EUROSISTEMA

Pension Reform, Fiscal Policy and Economic Performance

Seminari e convegni
Workshops and Conferences

aprile 2010

numero

3



BANCA D'ITALIA
EUROSISTEMA

Pension Reform, Fiscal Policy and Economic Performance

Seminari e convegni
Workshops and Conferences

Earlier versions of the papers in this volume were presented at the Banca d'Italia workshop on "Pension Reform, Fiscal Policy and Economic Performance" held in Perugia, S.A.Di.Ba., on 26-28 March, 2009. We wish to thank the staff of S.A.Di.Ba. for their assistance in all aspects of the organization of the workshop.

Previous Public Finance workshops have addressed the following topics:

"Indicators of Structural Budget Balances" (1998)

"Fiscal Sustainability" (2000)

"Fiscal Rules" (2001)

"The Impact of Fiscal Policy" (2002)

"Tax Policy" (2003)

"Public Debt" (2004)

"Public Expenditure" (2005)

"Fiscal Indicators" (2006)

"Fiscal Policy: Current Issues and Challenges" (2007)

"Fiscal Sustainability: Analytical Developments and Emerging Policy Issues" (2008)

The proceedings may be requested from:

Banca d'Italia
Biblioteca
Via Nazionale, 91
00184 Roma
Italy

The contents of this book do not commit Banca d'Italia. Responsibility for the ideas and opinions expressed rests with the authors of the individual papers.

STRUCTURAL ECONOMIC ANALYSIS DEPARTMENT
PUBLIC FINANCE WORKSHOP

Pension Reform, Fiscal Policy and Economic Performance

Papers presented at the Banca d'Italia workshop
held in Perugia, 26-28 March, 2009

CONTENTS

Foreword

Daniele Franco (<i>Banca d'Italia</i>).....	p. 11
--	-------

Introduction

Daniele Franco, Maria Rosaria Marino and Pietro Tommasino (<i>Banca d'Italia</i>).....	p. 13
---	-------

Session 1

PENSION REFORM AND THE LABOUR MARKET

1. Consumption Structure, Welfare Goods and Retirement Income: Linking the Ageing Puzzles Najat El-Mekkaoui De Freitas* and Joaquim Oliveira Martins*,** (* <i>Université Paris-Dauphine</i>) (** <i>OECD</i>)	p. 29
2. Public Pensions and the Labour Market in New Zealand Paul Rodway (<i>New Zealand Treasury</i>)	p. 51
3. An Ageing Europe at Work: Are the Incentives to Work Sufficient to Provide Adequate and Sustainable Pensions in the Future? Lessons from the Open Method of Coordination Asees Ahuja and Ruth Paserman (<i>European Commission</i>)	p. 69
4. Retirement Behaviour and Retirement Incentives in Spain Isabel Argimón,* Marta Botella,** Clara I. González*** and Raquel Vegas*** (* <i>Financial Stability Department, Banco de España</i>) (** <i>Research Department, Banco de España</i>) (*** <i>FEDEA</i>)	p. 103
5. Assessing the Short-term Impact of Pension Reforms on Older Workers' Participation Rates in the EU: A Diff-in-Diff Approach Alfonso Arpaia,*,** Kamil Dybczak** and Fabiana Pierini.** (* <i>IZA</i>) (** <i>European Commission</i>)	p. 135

6. Valuation of the Hungarian Pension System

Erzsébet Kovács

(*Corvinus University of Budapest*) p. 173

Comments

Johannes Clemens

(*Deutsche Bundesbank*) p. 183

Comments

Tomáš Jędrzejowicz

(*Narodowy Bank Polski*) p. 187

Comments

Walpurga Köhler-Töglhofer

(*Österreichische Nationalbank*) p. 191

Session 2

PENSION REFORM AND CAPITAL MARKETS

7. Privatizing Pensions: More than an Interesting Thought?

Nick Draper and Ed Westerhout

(*CPB – Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis*) p. 199

8. The Impact of the Financial Crisis on Funded Pension Saving

Robert Gillingham, Adam Leive and Anita Tuladhar

(*IMF*) p. 217

9. Pension Systems in EMES: Implications for Capital Flows and Financial Markets

Ramón Moreno and Marjorie Santos

(*Bank for International Settlements*) p. 231

10. Reforming the Pension Reforms: The Recent Initiatives and Actions on Pensions in Argentina and Chile

Rafael Rofman,^{*} Eduardo Fajnzylber^{**} and German Herrera^{***}

(^{*} *World Bank*)

(^{**} *Superintendence of Pension Fund Administrators, Chile*)

(^{***} *University of San Andrés*) p. 261

11. Pension Funds' Contribution to the Enhancement of Aggregate Private Saving: A Panel Data Analysis for Emerging Economies

Ernesto Rezk, Mariano Irace and Vanina Ricca

(*National University of Córdoba, Argentina*) p. 309

12. Pension Privatization and Country Risk	
Alfredo Cuevas, [*] María González, [*] Davide Lombardo [*] and Arnoldo López-Marmolejo ^{**}	
([*] IMF)	
(^{**} BBVA Bancomer)	p. 345
13. Pension Funds and Financial Markets: Evidence from the New EU Member States	
Nadine Leiner-Killinger, Christiane Nickel and Michal Slavík	
(European Central Bank).....	p. 367
Comments	
António Afonso	
(ECB and ISEG/UTL – Technical University of Lisbon)	p. 389
Comments	
Laura Muriel Cuccaro	
(Banco Central de la República Argentina)	p. 395
Comments	
Frank Eich	
(Pension Corporation)	p. 399

Session 3

PENSION REFORM, REDISTRIBUTION, MACROECONOMIC IMPACT

14. Distributive Effects of Israel's Pension System	
Adi Brender	
(Bank of Israel)	p. 405
15. "So Pensions in Europe Will Remain Sustainable. But Will They Remain Adequate?"	
An Assessment of the Consequences of the AWG Projections on the Adequacy of Social Security Pensions in Belgium, Italy and Germany	
Gijs Dekkers, [*] **** Hermann Buslei, ^{**} Maria Cozzolino, ^{***} Raphael Desmet, ^{****}	
Johannes Geyer, ^{**} Dirk Hofmann, ^{**} Michele Raitano, ^{***} Viktor Steiner, [*] Paola	
Tanda, ^{***} Simone Tedeschi ^{***} and Frédéric Verschuere ^{****}	
([*] Centre for Sociological Research, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven)	
(^{**} Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung)	
(^{***} Istituto di Studi e Analisi Economica, Italy)	
(^{****} Federal Planning Bureau, Belgium)	p. 431

16. Public Transfers and the Age-profile of Poverty in Europe Daniele Franco, Maria Rosaria Marino and Pietro Tommasino (Banca d'Italia)	p. 453
17. Some Reflections on Pension Reforms in India Mallavarapu Ramaiah (Reserve Bank of India)	p. 487
18. Macroeconomic Implications of Pension Reform or How to Pay for the Crisis Ray Barrell, Ian Hurst and Simon Kirby (NIESR, UK)	p. 503
19. Poverty and Income of Older People in OECD Countries Asghar Zaidi (European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research, Vienna).....	p. 515
20. The Outlook for Pension Spending and the Role of a Reserve Fund Falilou Fall and Nicolas Ferrari (Ministère de l'Economie, de l'Industrie et de l'Emploi, France).....	p. 537
Comments Carlo Cottarelli (IMF).....	p. 551
Comments Glenn Follette (Federal Reserve Board)	p. 555
Comments Laurent Paul (Banque de France)	p. 561

Session 4

PENSION REFORM AND FISCAL POLICY

21. Choosing a Pension Reform: A Framework for the Social Planner Frédéric Gonand (Ecole Polytechnique, France)	p. 567
--	--------

22. Economic and Budgetary Effects of Pension Reforms in EU Member States Giuseppe Carone and Per Eckefeldt (<i>European Commission</i>)	<i>p. 591</i>
23. Social Security Reforms in Colombia: Striking Demographic and Fiscal Balances Sergio Clavijo (<i>ANIF, Colombia</i>)	<i>p. 629</i>
24. The Reform of the Portuguese Public Employees' Pension System: Reasons and Results Vanda Cunha, Ariana Paulo, Nuno Sousa Pereira and Hélder Reis (<i>Ministry of Finance and Public Administration, Portugal</i>).....	<i>p. 653</i>
25. Pension Plan Revision and Fiscal Consolidation of Japan Motonobu Matsuo (<i>Ministry of Finance, Japan</i>)	<i>p. 691</i>
26. Pension Reform and Fiscal Policy: Some Lessons from Chile Ángel Melguizo, [*] Ángel Muñoz, ^{**} David Tuesta ^{***} and Joaquín Vial ^{*,***} ([*] <i>OECD Development Centre</i>) (^{**} <i>BBVA, Pension and Insurance</i>) (^{***} <i>BBVA, Research Economic Department</i>)	<i>p. 709</i>
Comments Geert Langenus (<i>National Bank of Belgium</i>)	<i>p. 735</i>
Comments Per Eckefeldt (<i>European Commission</i>)	<i>p. 741</i>
Comments Teresa Ter-Minassian (<i>IMF</i>).....	<i>p. 745</i>

Contributors

António Afonso (*ECB and ISEG/UTL – Technical University of Lisbon*)
Asees Ahuja (*European Commission*)
Isabel Argimón (*Banco de España*)
Alfonso Arpaia (*European Commission and IZA*)
Ray Barrell (*NIESR, UK*)
Marta Botella (*Banco de España*)
Adi Brender (*Bank of Israel*)
Hermann Buslei (*Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung*)
Giuseppe Carone (*European Commission*)
Sergio Clavijo (*ANIF, Colombia*)
Johannes Clemens (*Deutsche Bundesbank*)
Carlo Cottarelli (*IMF*)
Maria Cozzolino (*Istituto di Studi e Analisi Economica, Italy*)
Laura Muriel Cuccaro (*Banco Central de la República Argentina*)
Alfredo Cuevas (*IMF*)
Vanda Cunha (*Ministry of Finance and Public Administration, Portugal*)
Gijs Dekkers (*Centre for Sociological Research, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven and Federal Planning Bureau, Belgium*)
Raphael Desmet (*Federal Planning Bureau, Belgium*)
Nick Draper (*CPB – Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis*)
Kamil Dybczak (*European Commission*)
Per Eckefeldt (*European Commission*)
Frank Eich (*Pension Corporation*)
Najat El-Mekkaoui De Freitas (*Université Paris-Dauphine*)
Eduardo Fajnzylber (*Superintendence of Pension Fund Administrators, Chile*)
Falilou Fall (*Ministère de l'Economie, de l'Industrie et de l'Emploi, France*)
Nicolas Ferrari (*Ministère de l'Economie, de l'Industrie et de l'Emploi, France*)
Glenn Follette (*Federal Reserve Board*)
Daniele Franco (*Banca d'Italia*)
Johannes Geyer (*Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung*)
Robert Gillingham (*IMF*)
Frédéric Gonand (*Ecole Polytechnique, France*)
Clara I. González (*FEDEA*)
María González (*IMF*)
German Herrera (*University of San Andrés*)
Dirk Hofmann (*Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung*)
Ian Hurst (*NIESR, UK*)
Mariano Irace (*National University of Córdoba, Argentina*)
Tomasz Jędrzejowicz (*Narodowy Bank Polski*)
Dušan Kidrič (*IMAD, Slovenia*)

Simon Kirby (*NIESR, UK*)
Erzsebet Kovács (*Corvinus University of Budapest*)
Walpurga Köhler-Töglhofer (*Österreichische Nationalbank*)
Geert Langenus (*National Bank of Belgium*)
Nadine Leiner-Killinger (*European Central Bank*)
Adam Leive (*IMF*)
Davide Lombardo (*IMF*)
Arnoldo López-Marmolejo (*BBVA Bancomer*)
Maria Rosaria Marino (*Banca d'Italia*)
Motonobu Matsuo (*Ministry of Finance, Japan*)
Ángel Melguizo (*OECD Development Centre*)
Ramón Moreno (*Bank for International Settlements*)
Ángel Muñoz (*BBVA, Pension and Insurance*)
Christiane Nickel (*European Central Bank*)
Joaquim Oliveira Martins (*OECD and Université Paris-Dauphine*)
Ruth Paserman (*European Commission*)
Laurent Paul (*Banque de France*)
Ariana Paulo (*Ministry of Finance and Public Administration, Portugal*)
Fabiana Pierini (*European Commission*)
Michele Raitano (*Istituto di Studi e Analisi Economica, Italy*)
Mallavarapu Ramaiah (*Reserve Bank of India*)
Hélder Reis (*Ministry of Finance and Public Administration, Portugal*)
Ernesto Rezk (*National University of Córdoba, Argentina*)
Vanina Ricca (*National University of Córdoba, Argentina*)
Paul Rodway (*New Zealand Treasury*)
Rafael Rofman (*World Bank*)
Marjorie Santos (*Bank for International Settlements*)
Michal Slavík (*European Central Bank*)
Nuno Sousa Pereira (*Ministry of Finance and Public Administration, Portugal*)
Viktor Steiner (*Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung*)
Paola Tanda (*Istituto di Studi e Analisi Economica, Italy*)
Simone Tedeschi (*Istituto di Studi e Analisi Economica, Italy*)
Teresa Ter-Minassian (*IMF*)
Pietro Tommasino (*Banca d'Italia*)
David Tuesta (*BBVA, Research Economic Department*)
Anita Tuladhar (*IMF*)
Raquel Vegas (*FEDEA*)
Frédéric Verschueren (*Federal Planning Bureau, Belgium*)
Joaquín Vial (*BBVA, Pension and Insurance and Research Economic Department*)
Ed Westerhout (*CPB – Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis*)
Asghar Zaidi (*European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research, Vienna*)